

A Study of Scottish Gaelic Versions of 'Snow-White'

JOY FRASER

In an article published in 1972, Heda Jason sets out to 'confront Propp's analysis [of folktale structure] with the concept of the 'tale-type' and concludes that "type' disintegrates under . . . synchronic structural analysis' (37, 53). Jason argues that the relationships among '*the concrete texts narrated in the society*' can be more appropriately conceptualised as a continuum (which she terms a 'tale-field') than as a series of self-contained units each with 'an independent 'life' in time and space' (39; emphasis in original). In his recent study of 'Snow-White' (AT 709), Steven Swann Jones follows Jason in pointing out the need for a new approach to the concept of the tale type. In Jones' thesis, however, the concept of the tale type remains essentially intact, but is viewed not as a 'self-contained unit' but rather as a system open to influences brought about by contact with other, similar systems. Unlike Jason, Jones argues that the historic-geographic and structural approaches to folktale research may 'be usefully combined into one synthesised methodology for the study of the formal features of folk narratives' (20), and moreover that this 'structural approach to typological analysis' allows the researcher to 'investigate the fundamental paradigm underlying the fairy tale in all its versions' (22, 26). This 'fundamental paradigm', 'a subliminal narrative code' which 'gives the story form and structure' and 'makes a significant contribution to the communication of meaning to the audience', can be uncovered through structural analysis at two distinct levels, the typological and the generic (78–9, 21). Although Jones focuses primarily on the typological structure of 'Snow-White', he also discusses the tale in the wider, generic context of the Persecuted Heroine cycle to which the tale belongs. Constituent tales of this cycle, he argues, though they 'follow their own distinct typological pattern of episodes . . . also share a generic pattern of action', which he terms the 'persecution pattern'. This pattern consists of four stages, 'threat, hostility, expulsion, and resolution', which 'coincide with . . . the most crucial trials or transitions in the heroine's life – menstruation, marriage, and childbirth' (30, 32). Significantly, Jones demonstrates that there is a strong 'semiotic resemblance' between tales belonging to the same cycle and posits that 'the persecution pattern is an empirically verifiable unit of dramatic structure apparent to narrators' (32, 29). This suggests that the generic paradigm functions as the primary means by which cultural meaning is communicated in narratives belonging to the Persecuted Heroine cycle. Because 'different tale types in the Persecuted Heroine cycle may alternately focus on

different stages of the heroine's development', Jones argues that such tales 'should be told and read as a group, as possessing a *larger composite meaning* that is only partially revealed in any particular tale type' (33–4; emphasis added).

Analysis of Scottish Gaelic versions of 'Snow-White' presents an ideal opportunity to test this theory by applying it to a single case within a particular tradition. Jones makes reference to just one Scottish version of AT 709, collected in Eigg by Kenneth Macleod in the late nineteenth century (Macleod).¹ Crucially, he appears to be unaware of both a second version from Eigg, referred to by Macleod in a footnote, and a unique version from Lochaber already studied by Alan Bruford (Bruford²). According to Bruford, the latter version is 'a conflation of elements from 'Snow-White' (AT 709) with a framework from 'The Maiden without Hands' (AT 706)' (Bruford and MacDonald: 448n). Since the latter tale type also belongs to the Persecuted Heroine cycle, Jones' concept of generic paradigms may be useful in accounting for the appearance in Scotland of a composite version of two differing but related tale types. In this paper I examine this hypothesis through an analysis of the three known Scottish versions mentioned above, as well as a story of related form collected in South Uist by John Francis Campbell. The latter is catalogued in the School of Scottish Studies Tale Archive under AT 706 (Campbell: 439n).³ Summaries of these four narratives can be found in Table 1. Campbell's story exhibits clear parallels with Bruford's Lochaber version of 'Snow-White' and contributes significantly to our understanding of the process by which this type (AT 709) assumed its distinctive Scottish form. By tracing within these stories aspects of structure and theme which span tale types AT 709 and AT 706, I argue that the structuralist view of the tale type as an enclosed, sealed unit fails to address the often complex processes by which types may become interwoven. I use the case study of 'Snow-White' in Scottish Gaelic tradition to demonstrate how Jones' concept of generic paradigms may bring us closer to a conception of the relationships among tale types as a continuum or 'tale-field' (Jason: *passim*).

Jones devises a model of two parts and nine episodes to describe the typological structure or 'essential paradigm of action' of AT 709. Each part (or 'move') comprises one instance of the 'persecution pattern' (threat, hostility, expulsion and resolution), with each resolution being effected 'in a way that appears to alter [the heroine's] situation, status, and environment' (28–9). In part one, 'the heroine is expelled from her home and adopted by someone else'. This part involves four episodes, which Jones terms 'Origin', 'Jealousy', 'Expulsion' and 'Adoption'. In the 'Origin' episode, 'an introductory etiological motif explains the creation or conception of the heroine or describes [her] familial situation'. In the 'Jealousy' episode, 'the persecutor . . . becomes jealous of the heroine's beauty', and, in the 'Expulsion' episode, 'orders the heroine's death or otherwise expels her from home'. In the 'Adoption' episode, 'the heroine is rescued from her homeless plight'. Part two involves 'a repetition of the pattern of rivalry, attack, rescue, and relocation . . ., but with more serious consequences'. This part involves five episodes, which Jones terms 'Renewed Jealousy', 'Death', 'Exhibition', 'Resuscitation'

and 'Resolution'. In the 'Renewed Jealousy' episode, 'the persecutor hears that the heroine has survived the ordeal of expulsion, has been adopted by someone else, and is still more beautiful', and 'again becomes jealous of her'. In the 'Death' episode, 'the persecutor apparently kills the heroine despite the interference of her companions', and in the 'Exhibition' episode, 'the heroine's companions prepare and exhibit the corpse'. In the 'Resuscitation' episode, 'the heroine is revived', and, finally, the 'Resolution' episode 'details the outcome of the drama', which 'generally includes the heroine's marriage and the persecutor's punishment' (22–4).

In the left-hand column of Table 1 are listed the episodes of AT 709 according to Jones' model as outlined above. The unshaded sections of the table illustrate the application of this model to the four Scottish Gaelic variants (including Campbell's), which are ordered from left to right according to degree of conformity to Jones' model.⁴ Apart from Campbell's South Uist variant which, as already noted, seems to belong to a separate tale type (AT 706), the table illustrates that the Scottish versions each incorporate all of Jones' episodes in sequence, and that where they deviate from the pattern of action he describes, these deviations occur in addition to the episodes of his model rather than replacing them. In the far right-hand column of the table is a similar breakdown of episodes for AT 706, adapted from that given by Aarne and Thompson (240).⁵ The shaded sections of the table represent elements within the Scottish Gaelic variants which cannot be accommodated within Jones' model, and might therefore be classified as deviations. However, if we are to revise the notion of the tale type as sealed unit then, as the table illustrates, it is possible to view these apparent deviations as influences from AT 706 and thus important points of contact between the two types. From right to left each Scottish variant incorporates fewer elements from AT 706. Thus the table illustrates a process of interweaving between the two tale types, AT 709 and AT 706, as exhibited in four Scottish Gaelic versions of 'Snow-White'. We can test this theory of the interweaving of types by examining in greater detail one of the versions summarised in the table. The Lochaber version is the fullest and most documented available and, as noted above, has already been recognised as 'a conflation of elements from 'Snow-White' [and] 'The Maiden without Hands'' (Bruford and MacDonald: 448n). If the points at which this narrative deviates from Jones' model for AT 709 can be identified as points of contact with AT 706, and parallels identified in Scottish versions of the latter type⁶, this will offer some insight into the process by which these two tale types have become interwoven in the Scottish case.

The Lochaber version's first deviation from Jones' model occurs between the 'Jealousy' and 'Expulsion' episodes. This first deviation involves the *eachrais ùrlair*⁷ who has, in the preceding episode, incited the stepmother's jealousy of the heroine. It can be posited that the figure of the *eachrais ùrlair* and the block of associations surrounding her character were incorporated wholesale into the Lochaber version from AT 706, thus playing an integral part in the process by which the two types became interwoven. Certainly, she makes no appearance in the first Eigg version, which incorporates least

influence from the latter type. The 'witch or wise woman' in the second Eigg version is, however, almost certainly the equivalent of the *eachrais ùrlair*, who appears in most Scottish Gaelic versions of AT 706 (Nic Iain; SA 1970/44/A; SA 1971/43/A3-B1). This character now persuades the stepmother to kill, in turn, her husband's greyhound bitch, his 'graceful black palfrey', and her own eldest son. She is instructed to lay the blame for each incident on the heroine, who is made to swear 'three baptismal oaths, that she will not be on foot, she will not be on horseback, and she will not be on the green earth the day she tells of it'.⁸ Bruford (170n) states that '[t]his motif is apparently borrowed from AT 706' and it is paralleled, including the oaths, in Buchan's and McKay's Scottish versions of that type (Buchan: 25–6; McKay: 308–11) and omitting the oaths in SA 1971/43/A3-B1 from South Uist. It can be categorised under the 'False Accusations' episode of AT 706 and is a clear point of contact between the two types.

The Lochaber version's second deviation from Jones' model directly follows the 'Expulsion' episode, during which the stepmother has demanded the heroine's heart and liver as a cure for a feigned sickness. This second deviation is the logical sequel of the first, as, in it, 'the end of one of [the heroine's] fingers' is cut off by her father for each crime of which she is accused. Again, according to Bruford (172n), '[t]he mutilation of the daughter is part of the borrowing from AT 706'. Indeed, as we will see, it is crucial to the narrative structure of that type, occurring in all Scottish versions. Some Scottish versions of AT 706 also feature the motif of the thorn in the king's foot, which usually results from a curse uttered by the heroine following her mutilation and can only be cured by her own two hands or those of her son (Buchan: 27; McKay: 313; Nic Iain: 49n; SA 1956/181/1; SA 1958/68/A2; SA 1971/43/A3-B1). Traces of this motif remain in the deviating second half of Campbell's South Uist version as summarised in the table, in which the heroine returns home to find her father with a wounded leg which can only be cured by her two hands, which have meanwhile been restored. Thus the 'Mutilation' episode and, in fragmented form, the curse which results from it, represent additional points of contact between AT 709 and AT 706.

The Lochaber version's third deviation from Jones' model consists of three elements, designated A-C in the table. The first of these elements (A) involves the renewal of the stepmother's jealousy for a second time. The second element (B) involves a pursuit, in which the stepmother journeys with her husband to Lochlann, where the heroine is now living, in order to kill her. Both of these apparently deviating elements can in fact be accommodated into Jones' model if we regard the Lochaber variant as one of 'certain oicotypical versions of 'Snow White' [which] go on to include a third instance of the persecution pattern'. According to Jones, these oicotypical versions incorporate 'a third repetition of hostilities', which 'follows the heroine's marriage'. In this third repetition of the pattern, '[w]hen the persecutor hears that the heroine has revived and is now married, the persecutor tries once more to dispatch her rival, attacking her in the husband's house' (Jones: 29). Thus the first two elements (A and B) of this third deviation can be regarded not as anomalies but as evidence of the Lochaber version's

AT 709 (from Jones)	EIGG 1	EIGG 2	LOCHABER	SOUTH UIST	AT 706 (adapted from AT)
ORIGIN	Persecutor is heroine's natural mother. Agent: Trout in well. Jealousy is of heroine's beauty.	As Eigg 1 [?]. [Implied]. Agent: Witch / wise woman.	Death of mother; father remarries. Agent: <i>Eachtraiis ìrlair</i> . Jealousy is due to heroine's larger share of inheritance.	Death of mother; father remarries. Heroine's right to inheritance over stepmother's own daughter.	ORIGIN
JEALOUSY	Queen demands heroine's heart and liver as cure for feigned sickness. A he-goat's organs are substituted. Heroine not expelled but taken in marriage by prince.	FALSE ACCUSATIONS Wise woman bewitches heroine and 'tries to make her kill': A) king's horse; B) king's dog; C) king's cock. Queen later commits the killings herself, laying blame on heroine. Queen suggests punishment of eating heroine's heart. A goat's heart is substituted. Heroine runs away.	FALSE ACCUSATIONS <i>Eachtraiis ìrlair</i> persuades stepmother to kill: A) king's greyhound bitch; B) king's graceful black palfrey; C) own eldest son. Blame is laid on heroine. She is made to swear 'three baptismal oaths', that she will not be on foot, on horseback or on the green earth the day she tells of it. Stepmother demands heroine's heart and liver as cure for feigned sickness. A sucking pig is substituted. King smuggles heroine into forest, with help of cook.	FALSE ACCUSATIONS Stepmother: A) gives away three greyhound pups to ship's captain, accusing heroine of killing them; B) breaks candlesticks and lays blame on heroine.	FALSE ACCUSATIONS/ SLANDERING
EXPULSION					
P					
A					
R					
T					
1					
ADOPTION	Marriage to prince; they go abroad.	Heroine hides with prince's hen-wife. Prince discovers and marries her.	MUTILATION OF HEROINE Father cuts off one finger for each crime of which she is accused.	MUTILATION OF HEROINE Father cuts off one hand; one breast; one knee.	MUTILATION OF HEROINE
RENEWED JEALOUSY	Agent: Trout in well.	As Eigg 1.	One-eyed leader of band of cats is King of Lochlann's son. They are married, and have three children, who remain unchristened. Agent: Trout in well. This time jealousy is motivated by heroine's beauty.	Heroine staggers to house occupied by three princes, who are 'under spells'. Has two sons by 'finest looking' prince.	MARRIAGE
DEATH	Queen goes to visit heroine with intention of killing her. Heroine locked in room, but puts little finger through keyhole; Queen puts a 'poisoned stab' in it.	As Eigg 1.	Stepmother's maid sent with box containing poisoned 'grains of ice'.	RESTORATION OF LOST MEMBERS Achieved with help of 'old woman' and through the 'agency of a well'.	PERSECUTED WIFE (Eiggs: Lochaber)
EXHIBITION	Heroine locked in room where 'nobody would get near her'. Prince's second wife gets hold of key and takes stab out of finger.	As Eigg 1.	Heroine placed in leaden coffin inside locked room. Prince's second wife steals key to room and picks out the grains of ice with a pin.	CURING OF FATHER Heroine goes home to find father with wounded leg, only curable by her two hands. She cures him.	RESTORATION OF LOST MEMBERS (South Uist)
P					
A					
R					
T					
2					
RESOLUTION	PERSECUTED WIFE A) Renewed jealousy: as before. B) Pursuit: Queen journeys to foreign land again in order to kill heroine. C) Evasion: Prince's second wife makes Queen drink from poisoned cup. Queen carried home and buried. Prince and two wives 'were long alive . . . pleased and peaceful'.	PERSECUTED WIFE As Eigg 1.	PERSECUTED WIFE A) Renewed jealousy: as before. B) Pursuit: stepmother journeys to Lochlann with king in order to kill heroine. C) Evasion: 'Baptismal oaths' evaded by telling unchristened children. Stepmother caught and burnt in fire. Heroine's father is married to prince's second wife.	Stepmother burnt in fire. Marriage.	CURING OF FATHER (South Uist)

Table 1. The interweaving of AT 709 and AT 706 as exhibited in four Scottish Gaelic versions of 'Snow-White'.

status as an 'oicotypical version' of 'Snow-White' as defined by Jones. However, the final element (C), which comprises the heroine's evasion of the 'baptismal oaths' and fulfilment of the impossible conditions, is 'borrowed from . . . AT 706' and is 'the logical sequel' (Bruford: 173n) of the first deviation (see above). It therefore represents a further point of contact between the two tale types, part of the process by which elements from AT 709 and AT 706 have become conjoined in the Scottish Gaelic version of 'Snow-White'.

In seeking further explanation for the peculiar structure of the Lochaber version, it is necessary to turn to Irish evidence. Ó Súilleabháin and Christiansen (140–2) list 63 versions of AT 709 and 101 of AT 706.⁹ Bruford (154) states that many of the Irish manuscript versions of the former type are 'combinations of AT 709 with other international tales'. Yet although Bruford does cite some key parallels between the Lochaber and Eigg versions and a 'solid core' of the Irish ones, Ó Súilleabháin and Christiansen list no combinations of AT 709 with AT 706. Moreover, a Scottish Gaelic version exists (Eigg 1) which conforms almost in its entirety to the broader international pattern for AT 709, suggesting that the process by which this type became interwoven with AT 706 did not begin until some time after both tales' arrival in Scotland.

I therefore posit that what the Scottish Gaelic versions of 'Snow-White' inherited from Ireland was not their peculiar structure but rather a series of Gaelic oicotypical characteristics which are thematic rather than structural. The first of these characteristics is the trout in the well who incites the stepmother's jealousy of the heroine in the two Eigg versions. Jones comments that 'the omniscient trout in the well represents the magical forces of nature that operate according to the primal wisdom of the cosmos'; however, he describes this motif as the 'imaginative' product of 'poetic licence', not the result of 'the migration of the tale to different cultures and ethnic groups' (45, 79–80). While Bruford agrees in essence with Jones in classifying the trout (or salmon) 'as a metaphor for truth or poetic inspiration', he accounts for its appearance in the Lochaber and Eigg versions of AT 709 by citing its status as 'a basic image of early Irish mythology'. He comments that '[t]his archaic motif is not likely to be a recent substitute for the usual speaking mirror' in 'Snow-White' but is rather the story's 'most typically Gaelic feature' (172n; Bruford and MacDonald: 449n). Thus the motif of the trout or salmon in the well can be seen as an oicotypical characteristic probably originating in Ireland¹⁰ but retaining cultural significance in Scotland. For example, Bruford states that 'the trout was often kept in drinking-wells in Scotland and Ireland up to recent times to purify the water', while Banks (163) includes reference to an Islay well called '*Tobar a'bhric* . . . because it has never yet been seen without a trout in it. Long ago offerings used to be made to it, and old people treated it with much respect, under the belief that it possessed healing properties'.¹¹ Jones, reviewing an article on 'Snow-White' by Alfred Nutt (Nutt 1892), agrees that the inclusion of the motif of the omniscient trout in Macleod's narrative (Eigg 1) 'possibly points to an oicotypical version, that is, a locally specialised version, which may be of some antiquity' (Jones: 86).¹²

The second Gaelic oicotypical characteristic exhibited by the Scottish Gaelic versions is the lack of the 'companion' characters (dwarfs, robbers, and so on) who typically befriend the heroine during the 'Adoption' episode and are central to Jones' model of the type. The lack of the characters which Jones terms 'companions' means that the 'Adoption' episode as manifested in the Scottish versions of 'Snow-White' appears to bear closer resemblance to AT 706 than to AT 709. The former type 'follows a double pattern of hostilities directed against the heroine, first in her parents' home and then in her husband's home' (Jones: 30). In the case of AT 709, however, the persecution pattern almost always occurs in the parental home and then in the home of some 'companions'; only in its 'oicotypical extensions' does this type include a third repetition in the marital home. Apart from Macleod's, Jones lists no versions of AT 709 which omit the heroine's companions in favour of an immediate progression to her meeting with her future husband, and it is curious that Jones makes no comment on this distinguishing feature of Macleod's narrative. Bruford (173n) comments that '[e]vidently the Gaelic oicotype departed from the usual European pattern of the story where the heroine is poisoned when staying with the dwarfs or robbers, and later found in her coffin by the prince who revives her'. He adds that '[t]he prince in cat form, replacing the dwarfs or robbers, is in Irish versions of AT 709', and that in the Lochaber version the prince 'is as usual disenchanted by sleeping with the heroine' (Bruford and MacDonald: 449n). Although the connection between the prince's sleeping with the heroine and his disenchantment has been confused, this last motif is clearly paralleled in the manuscript of the South Uist version (f. 415v.), corroborating the Gaelic oicotypical theory and probable Irish connection. The enchanted state of the prince and his squires (in the Lochaber version, where '[t]hey had been bewitched by his stepmother') or brothers (in the South Uist version, where they are 'under spells') provides a link to the 'companions' of Jones' model. Their enchanted state is arguably equivalent to the 'quasi-human nature' of the 'companions', which Jones (35) sees as 'evidence of their role as liminal mediaries, . . . fictional shaman'. Thus the prince in the Lochaber and South Uist versions performs a double role, first as companion and later as the heroine's husband, a duality which has presumably been lost (or perhaps was never included) in the shorter Eigg versions.

The 'third instance of the persecution pattern' in the heroine's marital home can itself be viewed as a further Gaelic oicotypical characteristic incorporated by the Scottish Gaelic versions, this time structural rather than thematic. This feature is described by Jones as an oicotypical extension of the tale; he states that '[t]he persecution of the heroine in the husband's house is more commonly a part of a number of other folktale types', including AT 706 (29), but that it also occurs in around one fifth of the versions of AT 709 which he includes in his study. Moreover, because the Scottish Gaelic versions lack the 'companion' characters central to Jones' model of AT 709, the action proceeds more or less directly from the heroine's parental home to her marital one, so that both the second and the third repetitions of the persecution pattern take place within the marital home. Thus the persecution of the heroine in her husband's house can be seen as part of

the generic paradigm of the Persecuted Heroine cycle, equally suitable for incorporation within AT 709 and AT 706. A final Gaelic oicotypical characteristic incorporated by the Scottish Gaelic versions is the revival or resuscitation of the heroine by her husband's second wife¹³ and 'the bigamous resolution of the drama' (in Eigg 1).

I have argued above that the process by which AT 709 and AT 706 became interwoven within the Scottish Gaelic versions of 'Snow-White' did not begin until some time after both tales' arrival in Scotland. As evidence, I have cited a Scottish Gaelic version of 'Snow-White' (Eigg 1) which exhibits virtually 'no trace' of influence from AT 706. Indeed, this version's only deviation from Jones' model probably represents, like the corresponding deviation in the Lochaber version, an oicotypical extension of the tale as discussed above.¹⁴ Meanwhile, a second Scottish Gaelic version exists (Eigg 2) which closely resembles the first, except where it makes one additional deviation from Jones' model. Bruford labels the second Eigg version 'an intermediate form' of the story. Like the Lochaber version, it 'seems to have borrowed' from AT 706 the episode of the false accusations and extraction of oaths from the heroine. However, the ending of this version is 'as in the version [MacLeod] printed [i.e. Eigg 1], without the other borrowings from AT 706' incorporated by the Lochaber and South Uist versions (Bruford: 171n). Thus although the heroine's evasion of the oaths and fulfilment of the impossible conditions is 'the logical sequel' of the false accusations made against her, 'apparently MacLeod had heard a version with the one and without the other' (Bruford: 173n). The fact that the second Eigg version thus contains a significant structural 'illogicality' would seem to indicate that it represents an 'intermediate' stage in the transmogrification of this tale type in Scotland, part of a process whereby AT 709 gradually became conflated with elements from AT 706. While there is no apparent evidence of this process in the first Eigg version, there is considerably more in the Lochaber version than in Eigg 2. I therefore posit that preexisting Scottish versions of AT 709 were at some point influenced by elements from AT 706 which they adopted to greater (Lochaber) or lesser (Eigg 2) degrees.

The significance of the South Uist version lies in its suggestion of a possible source for these influences from AT 706. This version represents the most complete available conflation of AT 709 with the latter type, to the extent that the second half of the story constitutes a total deviation from Jones' typology. Several key links can be drawn between the deviations exhibited in this version and those of the Lochaber version. The first such link concerns the extraction of the oath from the heroine. As discussed above, the Lochaber version has the heroine forced to swear 'three baptismal oaths' that she will not be on foot, on horseback or 'on the green earth' the day she exposes the stepmother's false accusations. Similarly, in Campbell's version, the stepmother has given away each of her husband's three greyhound pups to 'a sea captain', accusing the heroine of killing them; she later breaks 'a candlestick of great price', again laying the blame on the heroine, and '[makes] her [step]daughter swear that she would not tell or she would kill her' (f. 415r.). In the manuscript of Campbell's version, the stepmother

herself has a child 'and she was wishing her own to have the kingdom'; this parallels the 'Jealousy' episode in the Lochaber version, in which the stepmother's jealousy is due to the fact 'that the day the king dies, your share of the inheritance will be a small one compared to your stepdaughter's share'.¹⁵ This is in contrast to the pattern found in most of the versions of AT 709 studied by Jones, in which the stepmother's jealousy is usually incited by the heroine's beauty.

The second link between the South Uist and Lochaber versions concerns the mutilation of the heroine. As we have seen, the Lochaber version has the heroine's father cut off one of her fingertips for each crime of which she is accused. The threefold mutilation of 'half [one] hand', 'half breast' and 'half knee' in the South Uist version may similarly correspond to the three greyhound pups she stands accused of killing (although this does not account for the fourth alleged crime, that of breaking the candlestick). In some versions of AT 709 studied by Jones one of the heroine's fingers is similarly amputated, to be sent as proof of her murder to the stepmother (Jones: 45–6; 105–6). However, the threefold nature of the mutilation in the Lochaber and South Uist versions makes clear that in these cases it is the direct consequence of the crimes of which the heroine is accused. The more drastic mutilations in the South Uist version conform more closely than those in the Lochaber version to the narrative structure of AT 706, much of which hinges on the 'crippling' of the heroine. The 'Mutilation' episode in the South Uist version therefore determines that the second half of the story must closely follow the structure of AT 706. In the Lochaber version, however, the significance of this episode to the latter sections of the narrative is lost, because those elements of AT 706 which result from the heroine's crippling are irrelevant in this case (see Bruford: 172n).

The 'Mutilation' episode leads in turn to a third key link between the Lochaber and South Uist versions, a link which concerns the means by which the heroine is discovered by her future husband (Jones' 'Adoption' episode). In the Lochaber version, the 'one-eyed grey cat' sends his twelve squires up the tree one by one to investigate the source of the 'king's blood or knight's blood [that] was falling into the cauldron'; the squires are bribed by the heroine not to tell that she is there, and eventually the one-eyed cat himself climbs the tree and brings her down. This is clearly paralleled in the South Uist version, in which the 'finest looking' prince sends each of his two brothers outside to search for the heroine after discovering 'a drop of king's blood on the Board'; they do not find her, and eventually he goes out himself and brings her in (f. 415v.). The motif of the discovery of the heroine by the drop of king's blood stems logically from the preceding 'Mutilation' episode and is a borrowing from AT 706 in which 'the heroine is sometimes found by her future husband in a tree' (motif N 711.1; see Bruford: 172n). Significantly, however, it is this same motif which 'serves to introduce the 'Snow-White' elements' in the Lochaber version (Bruford and MacDonald: 449n). Despite the heroine's occasional wounds in the versions of AT 709 studied by Jones, none of those versions contain this motif. It can therefore be posited that it is a key point of

integration between the two tale types which is peculiar to Scotland and results from the unusual structural amalgamation of AT 709 and AT 706 exhibited by the Scottish narratives studied here. In the detailed Lochaber version, the borrowing from AT 706 extends to the heroine's threefold mutilation as punishment for her alleged crimes, but not to her actual crippling. This motif therefore provides a key link back into the narrative structure of AT 709 which, unlike that of AT 706, requires the continuing mobility and physical beauty of the heroine. The motif also bestows an artistic fluidity upon the juncture of the two types.¹⁶

In his paper, the application of Jones' model of tale type AT 709 to a single case within a particular tradition calls into question not so much the concept of the tale type itself but rather the structuralist view of tale types as enclosed, sealed units entirely separable from one another. In light of this conclusion, Jason's modelling of the relationships among tales as a continuum or 'tale-field' may prove central to future folktale scholarship. I have explored the existence of common themes, images and structural features underlying two different but related tale types, AT 709 and AT 706, as they are found in Scotland. Rather than a sealed unit, I have shown that the tale type may be viewed as a system which exchanges key characteristics and thus interweaves with other, related systems. The significance of the episodes which appear to have served as key linkages between the two tale types discussed in this paper lies in the realm of meaning. It can be argued that the wider generic paradigm of the Persecuted Heroine cycle, rather than the typological structure of the individual tales which belong to it, functions as the primary carrier of cultural meaning in these narratives. It is the persecution pattern itself, not its specific manifestations in individual tales, which corresponds to the 'symbolic timing' of the transitional development of the young female heroine and the 'ritualistic organisation' of separation, liminality and reincorporation accompanying such transition (Jones: 34). Thus an amalgamation of elements from AT 709 and AT 706 could have taken place without significant alteration of the cultural or symbolic meaning of the tale. The study of 'Snow-White' in Scotland suggests that exclusive focus on single tale types rather than on the processes by which they interrelate may blind oral narrative scholarship to the significance of apparently anomalous local deviations. These may be far more profitably explained by extending the scope of study to the realms of ethnography, generic correspondence, and meaning.

NOTES

- 1 Jones' source is an 'edited' version of Macleod's story, in Joseph Jacobs' *Celtic Fairy Tales* (1883). An examination of Jacobs' text (1883: 88–92) reveals that minimal changes were made to the language of Macleod's translation.
- 2 Also in Bruford and MacDonald: 98–106.
- 3 It has been possible to consult Campbell's field-notes for this story, which are housed in the manuscript division of the National Library of Scotland, NLS 50.1.13: ff. 415–6, and

contain several details omitted from the summary published in *Popular Tales of the West Highlands*. Appendix A includes a full transcription.

- 4 'Eigg 2' is the version referred to by Macleod in a footnote to his printed version ('Eigg 1'). Unfortunately, Macleod's footnote, detailing only the points of divergence from Eigg 1, is the fullest available account of this version. For purposes of this paper the story has been reconstructed by combining the details provided with those sections of Eigg 1 with which it must be assumed to have shared fundamental characteristics.
- 5 This model is based on the episodes most commonly found in Scottish versions of AT 706, and is not intended to delineate a definitive structure of the type.
- 6 For Scottish versions of AT 706, see McKay 1940: 308–29; Nic Iain 1934: 46–9; SA 1970/44/A; SA 1971/43/A3–B1; Duncan J. MacDonald MS 15 p.1376; SA 1956/181/1; SA 1958/68/A2; Buchan 1908: 25–8.
- 7 'The *eachraib* (*eachlach*) *ùrlair*, 'floor groom', apparently a sweeper, is a female character who replaces the hen-wife as the stepmother's evil genius in many Gaelic tales' and who, in this case, 'first inspires the stepmother to wickedness' (Bruford and MacDonald: 448n; Bruford: 170n). McKay (492–499) provides a detailed discussion of this character, positing that '[the] Eachrais-Urlair was probably at one time an important member of the royal retinue . . . [and] probably continued in the discharge of her duties, whatever they were, until some social change occurred when the status of sorceress began to suffer loss' (494–5). Her role in the Lochaber version of 'Snow-White' is typical in that 'the terms she demands for her services in getting rid of the second queen's stepchildren are sometimes very curious and extortionate' (McKay: 498); in this case she asks for 'a seemingly small quantity of food and wool which then turns out to be immense', a demand which is 'part of the convention' of the character (Bruford: 170n).
- 8 ' . . . baptismal oaths' (*briathran baistidh*) – apparently meaning a vow not to tell a Christian soul' (Bruford and MacDonald: 448n). Elsewhere Bruford compares McKay: 327 (AT 706), in which 'the Queen made the lassie swear that whatever she saw her do, she would not tell to any man who had ever been baptized. Child! I am telling thee, for thou hast not yet been baptized'.
- 9 Includes related stories ('Cf.').
- 10 O'Rahilly (319) states that according to some Irish accounts, 'the source of all wisdom and occult knowledge is the Otherworld Well. This well, known as the well of Segais, was . . . situated beneath the sea in *Tír Tarrngire* (the Otherworld). Around it were hazel-trees, the fruit of which dropped into the well and caused bubbles of mystic inspiration (*na bolcca immaiss*) to form on the streams which issued from the well' (O'Rahilly: 322; see Gwynn *Metrical Dindshenchas* iii 286–288). Some accounts state that 'there were salmon in the Otherworld well, and as the wisdom-full hazel-nuts dropped into the water the salmon ate them'. This is one of several instances in which 'the Otherworld salmon [is] associated with wisdom' (O'Rahilly 1946: 323; see *Metrical Dindshenchas* iii 192). See also Rees and Rees: 161.
- 11 A link may be posited between the well of the trout in the 'Jealousy' episodes in the Eigg and Lochaber versions and the well through the agency of which the heroine's members

are magically restored in the deviating second half of the South Uist version (from AT 706). McKay (318n) states that 'we may suppose that in some remote version [of AT 706] the restoration of the lost members is ascribed to the fairy or goddess of the well'. Compare 'the virtues of the water of a particular well' in Buchan's version of AT 706 (27), by which her future husband's mother 'restored to [the heroine] the full use of her amputated limbs'. A version of the *Ceudach* story collected in Cape Breton by Margaret MacDonell and John Shaw (53–68) also contains '[the] motif of the life-restoring water (*uisge aith-bheothachaidh* [E80])'. The authors comment that '[in] some Irish (Munster) versions *Ceudach* is restored by water or lowered into a well' (89n). Meanwhile, in a version of AT 613, 'The Two Travellers', collected from Donald Alasdair Johnson (Shaw 1991: 98), Suil-a-Sporan and Suil-a-Dia are given 'news of a well that will cure all afflictions, including blindness. Suil-a-Dia finds the well, applies the water to his eyes and his sight is restored'. Such examples suggest that the healing water or well may be as much an active motif in Celtic tradition as the trout or salmon. In Donald Alasdair Johnson's versions of AT 706 (from South Uist), the well is replaced by a loch (SA 1970/44/A; SA 1971/43/A3-B1). The healing water motif appears in Scottish Gaelic versions of the type but not in Scots versions, which suggests that Buchan's version may be based at least partly on a Gaelic source.

- 12 Jones adds that '[w]hen we couple this with the considerable popularity in Ireland of 'Snow White'..., Nutt's argument for Gaelic origin becomes intriguing', but qualifies that 'Nutt's preoccupation with identifying a historical origin . . . is methodologically anachronistic' (86).
- 13 Bruford (173n) notes that in Irish versions of the tale '[the] second wife is always responsible for saving the heroine'.
- 14 This statement also applies to the identical deviation in Eigg 2.
- 15 Compare SA 1971/43/A3-B1 (AT 706), in which [summary] '*Eachlair Urlair* tells new Queen stepdaughter will inherit if King dies'.
- 16 It would be interesting to discover whether any of the Irish versions incorporate this motif, which I have been unable to find in Thompson's *Motif-Index*. Compare 'I see a young woman in the top of a tree, and moreover, blood is dripping from her body' (McKay: 313), which McKay classifies as N 711.1.

REFERENCES

- AARNE, ANTTI AND STITH THOMPSON
1961 *The Types of the Folktale*. Helsinki: FF Communications No. 184.
- BANKS, M. MACLEOD
1937 *British Calendar Customs: Scotland*. Vol. 1. London: William
Glaisher Ltd.
- BRIGGS, KATHARINE M.
1970 *A Dictionary of British Folk-Tales in the English Language*. Part A, Vol. 1.
London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.

- BRUFORD, ALAN
1965 'A Scottish Gaelic Version of 'Snow-White''. *Scottish Studies* 9: 153-74.
- BRUFORD, ALAN AND D. A. MACDONALD (EDS.)
1994 *Scottish Traditional Tales*. Edinburgh: Polygon.
- BUCHAN, PETER
1908 *Ancient Scottish Tales*. Ed. John A. Fairley. Peterhead.
- CAMPBELL, JOHN FRANCIS
1861 *Popular Tales of the West Highlands*. Vol. 3. Hounslow, Middlesex: Wildwood House Ltd., 1984.
- GWYNN, E. J.
1913 *The Metrical Dindshenchas*. Part 3. Dublin.
- JACOBS, JOSEPH (ED.)
1883 *Celtic Fairy Tales*. London: Random House, 1996.
- JASON, HEDA
1972 'Structural Analysis and the Concept of the 'Tale-Type''. *Arv* 28: 36-54.
- JONES, STEVEN SWANN.
1990 *The New Comparative Method: Structure and Symbolic Analysis of the Allomotifs of 'Snow White'*. Helsinki: FF Communications No. 247.
- MACDONELL, MARGARET AND JOHN SHAW (EDS.)
1981 *Luirgean Eachainn Nìll: Folktales from Cape Breton*. Stornoway: Acair.
- MCKAY, JOHN G.
1940 *More West Highland Tales*. Vol. I. Edinburgh and London: Oliver and Boyd.
- MacKechnie, John
1973 *Catalogue of Gaelic Manuscripts in selected libraries in Great Britain and Ireland*. 2 Vols. Boston, Mass.: G. K. Hall.
- MACLEOD, KENNETH.
1888 'Craobh-Oir agus Craobh-Airgid'. *The Celtic Magazine* 13: 212-8.
- NIC IAIN, ANNAG
1934 'Na Beanntan Gorma'. *Béaloideas* 4: 46-9.
- NUTT, ALFRED
1892 'The Lai of Eliduc and the Märchen of Little Snow-white'. *Folk-Lore* 3: 26-48.
- O'RAHILLY, THOMAS F.
1946 *Early Irish History and Mythology*. Dublin: Institute for Advanced Studies.

- Ó SÚILLEABHÁIN, SEÁN AND REIDAR TH. CHRISTIANSEN
1963 *The Types of the Irish Folktales*. Helsinki: FF Communications No. 188.
- REES, ALWYN AND BRINLEY
1961 *Celtic Heritage: Ancient Tradition in Ireland and Wales*. London: Thames and Hudson Ltd.
- SHAW, JOHN
1991 "Sgeulachd a' Chait Bhig 's a' Chait Mhóir': A Gaelic Variant of 'The Two Travellers' (AT 613)". *Scottish Studies* 30: 93–106.
- THOMPSON, STITH
1932–6 *Motif-Index of Folk-Literature*. 6 Vols. Bloomington: Indiana University Studies.

APPENDIX A:
TRANSCRIPTION OF NLS 50.1.13.*

f. 415r.

In the evening at [?Polacheth] walked into the kitchen of the Inn and sat down with a whole tribe of black haired girls of all ages. barefooted and barelegged. sitting on benches round the fire with their arms twined round each other and their eyes and teeth glancing in the fire light [over each others' shoulders]. An old man on a bench smoking. an oldish woman with black witch like elf locks returning from durance [?vile] for having sold unlawful whisky. the [?landlord] and the [?poultry] – Commenced operations with a song. got one from the liberated Lady which was a [?lively] wild monotonous love song set to the tune for [wauking ?stamping] clothes. – Next got a story. – A king somewhere "I don't know where – but it was long ago" lost his wife and he had by her one daughter. Then he married again – he was always out hunting. – His second wife had a child and she was wishing her own to have the kingdom. – so she was hard on her step daughter. – The king had a hound which he was very fond of and he gave his wife charge of the dog and it had three pups and no one was to get leave to touch them. – Now there was a captain of a ship who was always coming to see the Queen and she let him have one of the pups but she made her daughter swear that she would not tell or she would kill her. and when the king came home he found that one of the pups was gone. Then the step mother said. Thy daughter killed it. There is the knife on the board red with the blood. – So the king was very angry – on the

next day it was the same and on the next. Then the Queen broke a candlestick of great price and when the king had come home he was wrath and the Queen said again that his daughter had done it – Then the king took his daughter out to a moss and he said – Whether wouldst thou rather that I killed thee outright or that I should take off thy half [one] hand, and thy half breast and thy half knee (here the narrator used action and great emphasis and a shiver of horror ran round the junior part of the audience who were intently listening)... Then the daughter said, I would rather that you should do that same to me than kill me outright. And so he [cut] off her half hand

f. 415v.

and her half breast and her half knee – and he flung her into a peat hag and he left her there bleeding – Then she went staggering and [trailing] herself along as best she might down the course of a burn and she came to a kind of small bothan [of] a house – and she went in and there was a table spread with all kinds of meat and no one in – Then she heard people coming and hid herself – and there came in the three finest looking men she ever saw and they put off their cochal for they were under spells then one of them said, Some one has been here since we went out. Then the youngest said, No one has been here and the Eldest said the same but he who was finest looking of them said, There is here a drop of king's blood on the Board and I will not rest till I find out what it means. – Go out [thou/there] said he to the younger brother, go out said he and look without said he and see if thou canst not find someone who is bleeding and wounded said he. – Then the younger went out and found nothing and he sent out the Eldest in the same way, and he came in and he said [are you not] silly. Let us sit down and eat. – Then the other brother said I will go myself, and he found the very spot where the woman was and he brought her in between his two arms (here the narrator stretched out her own) and he washed and dressed her wounds and dried her himself with a towel and she told him all that befallen [sic] her, and he gave her food and he said, – Whether would you rather sleep in a bed by yourself or would you like better to sleep with me, and she said, I would rather sleep with

yourself and so they went into the same bed. And so it was for 3 quarters and then she had a lad son – and after a time she had another. Then one day as she was [?striving] to wash there came an old woman on the road and she said (something here [?I have] forgotten[]) and she made her as she was before. – and [?then] the

f. 416r.

brothers came home. The finest woman that ever they saw was before them. – After a time one day she heard one of her boys saying (something which I forget) and she asked him where he had learned that and he said he had heard his uncles saying to his father that he had better go and leave her for that she had lost her arm [sic] in the moss and had got them again no one knew how. Indeed said she they said that. – so she left the house herself and came home to the king's [?parish] and came into the kitchen. and she said What is your news here today and they said We are in grief and sorrow and all about the [?place] are in grief and [?sore] for the king's leg. – Indeed said she and what is the matter with the king – and so they told her that ever since the day when the daughter went away the king had lost [?the] use of his leg and many a doctor and many a leech and many a wise woman had been to see him and they could do no good at all. – for nothing would do him good but that his daughter should heal him with her two hands. and that she will not do for ever. – So she asked leave to go up and try if she could do good. And they said thou thou dirty poor woman. What couldst thou do where so many [?doctors and leeches, etc.] have done nothing. and so at last she got leave to go up. and she said to the king put out your leg and he did so on the bed side and it was all [?swelled/swollen] so she asked him how it had happened and he told. And he said. and nothing will ever cure me but my daughter with her two hands and that she will never do. – Then she laid her two hands on her father's leg and it was as well as ever it was and he cut a caper on the floor. – Then she told her Father all that the Queen had done how she had given the pups to the sea captain and how she had broken the candlestick. and the king was very sorry for what he had done to her and he [?caused] the queen to be seized

f. 416v.

and they made a great fire and burnt her and they
sent for the three lads and the lad bairns and
then they made a cheery light wedding. And that's
all I have of the Senachas. –

This was given without the fluency of the male narrators and
was confused in parts. There was a vast deal of dialogue and
many more details but this is the pith of the story. The
worthy woman was amply rewarded with a couple of glass[es]
of [?raw] whisky which she drank with the usual ceremonies
first a [?small] sip then a wry face. – Then a longer one
and the glass returned. – [~~Then~~] Oh! Take it out. Another long
pull. – [?_____] Scoop it out. and it goes down. And so
at the end of the story. – Da Capo. –